82818

SOEC: Materials, properties & challenges

Acknowledgements to colleagues at DTU Energy Conversion

 $\Delta E = 0$ $\Delta S \ge$

Anne Hauch DTU Energy Conversion

hauc@dtu.dk

DTU Energy Conversion Department of Energy Conversion and Storage

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view
- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance (H₂O / CO₂ / Co-electrolysis)
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells where are we heading?
- 11. Summing up / leaning objectives

Intro – who am I and who are you/your background?





Learning objectives (2 x SOE lectures):

- 1. Explain/sketch qualitatively how electrolysis (potentially) can become an important player in a future energy grid?
- 2. Explain the basic operation principle for steam electrolysis, CO₂ electrolysis, co-electrolysis
- 3. List typical electrode materials incl. requirements and operation conditions
- 4. Give examples of SOEC degradation issues and explain why some of these can be somewhat different from what can be observed for similar SOFCs (based on material properties, test conditions etc.)



Only pen & paper "allowed" – no Google or Wikepedia help ©

- 1. Make a sketch of an SOEC including names for typical electrode and electrolyte materials
- 2. Note on your sketch which electrode is cathode, anode, steam/hydrogen electrode and oxygen electrode
- 3. Write the electrode reactions and the total reaction for:
 - a) Electrolysis of steam
 - b) Electrolysis of carbon dioxide
- 4. Electrolysis of steam and carbon dioxide why is this more complex than just adding reaction a) and b) ?

⁴ DTU Energy Conversion, Technical University of Denmark

2. Basic working principle - answers

- 1. Make a sketch of an SOEC including names for typical electrode and electrolyte materials
- 2. Note on your sketch which electrode is cathode, anode, fuel electrode and oxygen electrode

...or with barrier layer and a MIEC electrode

DTU

 \mathbf{H}

2. Basic working principle - answers

Write the electrode reactions and the total reaction for:

- a) Electrolysis of steam
- b) Electrolysis of carbon dioxide

Ref. Ebbesen, Jensen, Hauch & Mogensen, "High Temperature Electrolysis", submitted, InTech, 2012 Ref. Haber, Zeitchr. Physik. Chem., 68, 731 (1909)

6 DTU Energy Conversion, Technical University of Denmark



Typical temp.: ~ 800-900 °C

Gas compositions:

 H_2O electrolysis – avoid Ni oxidation (inlet of $p(H_2O) = 0.99$ atm possible)

CO₂ electrolysis – avoid catalytic coke formation, T>800 °C and p(CO)<0.9 ⇒ Boudouard reaction shifted towards CO

Current density / cell voltage:

- Lab scale Up to 2 A/cm² durability testing
- Techn. relevant Potentiostatic / thermo-neutral potential The possibility for load cycling

Ref. Hauch, "Solid Oxide Electrolysis Cells – Performance and Durability", PhD Thesis, DTU (2010) Ref. Knibbe, Traulsen, Hauch, Ebbesen and Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157, B1209 (2010)



Ref. Ebbesen, Jensen, Hauch & Mogensen, "High Temperature Electrolysis", submitted, InTech, 2012

Our "competitor" crude oil



	Commercial low temperature	High temperature	High temperature	
	alkaline electrolyser	alkaline electrolyser	Solid oxide electrolyser	
Operation temperature	80 °C	264 °C	850 °C	
Investment cost	4420 €m ² cell area	4420 €m ² cell area	3620 €m ² cell area	
uel composition	_		$H_2O/H_2 = 90/10$	
Cell voltage at -0.25 A/cm ²	1.77 volts	1.46 volts	0.92 volts	
Cell voltage at -0.50 A/cm ²	_	1.55 volts	0.95 volts	
Cell voltage at -1.00 A/cm ²	Ave. EU price for retail/end-users		1.01 volts	
Life time	35 years 7 in 2007	35 years	10 years	
Operation time	50 %	50 %	50 %	
ırified Water cost	1.6 €m ³	1.6 €m ³	1.6 €m ³	
Electricity price	7.65 €¢/kWh	7.65 €¢/kWh	7.65 €¢/kWh	Electricity prices 2012:
Interest rate	8 %	8 %	8 %	<u>incept//www.energyted/</u>
nergy loss in heat exchanger	5 %	5 %	10 %	

Ref. Atmospheric electrolysers (Norsk Hydro), <u>http://www.hydro.com/electrolysers/</u> (2008) Ref. M. H. Miles, G. Kissel, P. W. T. Lu, S. Srinivasan, *J. Electrochem. Soc.*, **123**, 332 (1976). Ref. A. Hauch, S. H. Jensen, S. Ramousse, M. Mogensen, *J. Electrochem. Soc.*, **153**, A1741 (2006) Ref. S. H. Jensen, P. H. Larsen, M. Mogensen, *Int. J. Hydrogen Energy*, **32**, 3253 (2007).



The pie chart shows the production price parts given the assumptions on previous slide.

Ref. Ebbesen, Jensen, Hauch & Mogensen, "High Temperature Electrolysis", submitted, InTech, 2012

Based on SOEC at 850 °C, -0.5 A/cm²



 H_2 production price vs. lifetime

(Assuming an electricity price of 7.65 €¢/kWh - 2007 electricity price).

H₂ production price for SOECs depending on lifetime and cell degradation

(Assuming an electricity price of 7.65 €¢/kWh - 2007 electricity price).

For an estimate of syn-gas prodruction prices / SOE economic estimates: Syngas production via high-temperature steam/CO2 co-electrolysis, Fu, Mabilat, Zahid, Brisse & Gautier, Energy & Enviro. Sci.,3, 1382 (2010)

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view

Many different reports in lit. I just show a few selected ones!

- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance $(H_2O / CO_2 / Co-electrolysis)$
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells where are we heading?

11. Summing up / leaning objectives

5. Materials & initial performance - H₂O electrolysis

Different oxygen electrode materials

Some of the highest electrolysis performance to date (850 °C, H_2O/H_2 :50/50; O_2 to the oxygen electrode). Ref. S. Ebbesen, Dept. of Energy Conv. and Storage, DTU (former Risø DTU)



Figure 1. (a) V-i curves measured at 973 K, with 15% H₂O in H₂ at the Co-ceria-YSZ counter electrode and a $P_{O_2} = 1$ atm at the perovskite-based electrode. Data are for YSZ composites with LSM (\Box). LSF (O), and LSCo

Ref. Wang et al., JECS, 153, p.A2066 (2006)



Figure 3. Current-overpotential dependencies obtained on Ni-YSZ (gray symbols) and ceramic composite $La_{0.35}Sr_{0.65}TiO_{3-8}$ -Ce_{0.5} $La_{0.5}O_{1.75-8}$ (black symbols) electrodes at 750–850°C and $H_2/H_2O = 50/50$.

 $La_{0.35}Sr_{0.65}TiO_3 - Ce_{0.5}La_{0.5}O_{1.75}$ electrode at 800C at $H_2/H_2O = 50/50$, 20/80, and 10/90.

Ni/YSZ performance results SOFC><SOEC not necessarily a "universal" performance result! (can be structure dependent)

(Ref. Marina et al., JECS, 153, p.A2066, 2006 - Results obtained on half cells model set-up)







Ref. P.Kim-Lohsoontorn, J. Bae, J. Power Sources, 196(1), 7161 (2011) Ref. S. D. Ebbesen, R. Knibbe, M. Mogensen, *J. Electrochem. Soc.*, **159**, F482 (2012)

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view
- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance (H₂O / CO₂ / Co-electrolysis)
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells where are we heading?

11. Summing up / leaning objectives

 Let us review the "demand" on life-time based on economic estimates on fuel production prices...



We'll have a look at two SOEC degradation case stories today
+ incl. a small assignment for you.

6. Materials & durability – gas purity/impurity



Figure 2. Cell voltage and corresponding in-plane voltage at the Ni/YSZ electrode measured during (A) CO_2 (850°C, -0.25 A/cm², 70% CO_2 -30% CO), (B) H_2O (850°C, -0.50 A/cm², 50% H_2O -50% H_2), and (C) co-electrolysis (850°C, -0.25 A/cm², 45% H_2O -45% CO_2 -10% H_2).

Ref. Ebbesen, Graves, Hauch, Jensen & Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157(10), B1419 (2010)

20 DTU Energy Conversion, Technical University of Denmark



Observed change in in-plane voltage measurements made us believe that some sort of impurity contamination took place...

6. Materials & durability – gas purity/impurity

Assignments - impurities from different "sources" - estimates only (1000 h test)

A) Sulphur impurities in the gas stream:

In the experiments (see graphs) a total flow of 25 h/l was used for each electrode. How much sulphur did we lead to the tested cells if there is sulphur impurity of e.g. 100 ppb in the inlet gas? (is 100 ppb a realistic number?)

B) Si-impurities e.g. from the sealing material:

At the test conditions given the $p(Si(OH)_4)$ originating from the relevant glass sealing is app. 2.10⁻⁸ atm (still a flow of 25 h/l was used for each electrode).

C) Impurities in raw materials:

Calculate the total amount (mass) of SiO_2 in the raw materials in the half cell (i.e. electrolyte, H_2 electrode and support layer) based on:

"The cells had a 10–15 μ m thick hydrogen electrode of Ni/YSZ cermet and were supported by a 300 μ m thick Ni/YSZ layer, a 10–15 μ m thick YSZ electrolyte, and a 15–20 μ m thick LSM-YSZ composite oxygen electrode. The ratio between Ni and YSZ (ZrO₂ stabilized with 8 mol % Y₂O₃) was 40/60 vol % both for the support layer and the active electrode layer. The active electrode had an area of 16 cm². The porosity is app. 30%. The Si content was app. 12 ppm for both Ni and YSZ raw materials"

 $(\rho(Ni) = 8.9 \text{ g/cm}^3, \rho(YSZ) = 5.9 \text{ g/cm}^3, M(Ni) = 58,7 \text{ g/mol}, M(YSZ) = 123 \text{ g/mol and } M(SiO_2) = 60 \text{ g/mol})$



Figure 2. Cell voltage and corresponding in-plane voltage at the Ni/YSZ electrode measured during (A) CO_2 (850°C, -0.25 A/cm², 70% CO_2 -30% CO), (B) H_2O (850°C, -0.50 A/cm², 50% H_2O -50% H_2), and (C) co-electrolysis (850°C, -0.25 A/cm², 45% H_2O -45% CO_2 -10% H_2).

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view
- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance (H₂O / CO₂ / Co-electrolysis)
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells where are we heading?

11. Summing up / leaning objectives



Ref. Ebbesen, Graves, Hauch, Jensen & Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157(10), B1419 (2010)

Figure 7. (A) Cell voltage measured during CO₂ electrolysis (850°C, -0.25 A/cm^2 , 70% CO₂–30% CO), H₂O electrolysis (850°C, -0.25 A/cm^2 and -0.50 A/cm^2 , 50% H₂O–50% H₂), and during co-electrolysis of CO₂ and H₂O (850°C, -0.25 A/cm^2 , 45% CO₂–45% H₂O–10% H₂) with cleaned inlet gases. The increase in cell voltage during CO₂ electrolysis after 295 and 363 h of operation was caused by a sensor break in the oven temperature control causing a lowering of the cell temperature to 795 and 835°C, respectively. (B) Corresponding in-plane voltage at the Ni/YSZ electrode measured during either H₂O electrolysis (B_{H₂O}) or CO₂ electrolysis B_{CO₂}.



Ref. Ebbesen, Graves, Hauch, Jensen & Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157(10), B1419 (2010)

Ref. Hauch, Bowen, Kuhn & Mogensen, Electrochem. & Solid State Lett., 11(3), B38 (2008)

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view
- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance (H₂O / CO₂ / Co-electrolysis)
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells where are we heading?

11. Summing up / leaning objectives

9. SOE cells – Other durability and degradation issues

Electrolyte/O₂ electrode interface degr. at <u>high current densities</u>

850° C ,50:50 $H_2O:H_2$ to the Ni/YSZ electrode and O_2 to the oxygen electrode



Ref. Knibbe, Traulsen, Hauch, Ebbesen & Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157(8), B1209, 2010

²⁶ DTU Energy Conversion, Technical University of Denmark



9. SOE – Other durability and degradation issues

Figure 4. Ohmic resistance degradation with time for tests A (-2.0 A cm^{-2}) , B (-1.5 A cm^{-2}) , and C (-1.0 A cm^{-2}) .



Figure 2. Impedance spectra obtained at 850°C with 50:50 (H₂O:H₂) supplied to the Ni/YSZ hydrogen electrode, oxygen supplied to the LSM/YSZ oxygen electrode, and current density of -1.5 A cm². Characteristic process frequency of above given process arc.



Figure 5. Electrode polarization resistance degradation with time for tests A (-2.0 A cm^{-2}) , B (-1.5 A cm^{-2}) , and C (-1.0 A cm^{-2}) . R_p degradation from Ref. 22 included for reference point [850°C, 50:50 (H₂O:H₂), -0.5 A cm^{-2} with Si seals].

Main conclusion:



Sept. 26-27 2012

Electrolyte/O₂ electrode interface degr. at high current densities



Figure 8. Oxygen electrode overview: (a) Test A (-2.0 A cm⁻²) and (b) reference. Low magnification SE2 image with higher magnification inset.

DTU

Figure 9. Electrolyte overview: (a) Test A (-2.0 A cm^{-2}) inset of intergranular fracture running along grain boundary and (b) test C (-1.0 A cm^{-2}) .

TEM study of the YSZ grain boundaries.... \rightarrow

Ref. Knibbe, Traulsen, Hauch, Ebbesen & Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157(8), B1209, 2010

9. SOE – Other durability and degradation issues



TEM of YSZ grain boundary near oxygen electrode from cell tested at -2 A/cm^2 (R_s increase)

Testing of similar cells at 1.9 A/cm² (FC) do not show similar Rs degr. & YSZ grain boundary changes (A. Hagen et al., J. Electrochem. Soc)... \rightarrow





Standard potential of



Figure 11. Sketch of electromotive potential distribution through electrolyte thickness with the hydrogen electrode to the left and the oxygen electrode to the right. The arrows indicate the electromotive potential distribution changes with increase in SOEC current density.

Arrows indicate changes from OCV to electrolysis testing.

Nucleation and growth of oxygen in the YSZ grain boundaries (near O_2 electrode)

Formation of pores in the grain boundaries \Rightarrow very high grain boundary resistivity, which increases the YSZ ohmic resistance.

Ref. Knibbe, Traulsen, Hauch, Ebbesen & Mogensen, J. Electrochem. Soc., 157(8), B1209, 2010



For the hydrogen/steam electrode: <u>Ni/YSZ advantages:</u> Well-known, inexpensive electrode material Ni highly catalytic active for H₂O reduction (and for CO₂ red. as well) <u>Ni/YSZ disadvantages:</u> Prone to impurities (Sc-doping could be an alternative option) Ni evaporation (only relevant at high temp. and high p(H₂O)) Ni coarsening (all ceramic based electrode could be an alternative)

For the oxygen electrode and electrolyte/oxygen electrode: Delamination of the oxygen electrode (dependent on actual electrode/microstructure) Oxygen formation in YSZ grain boundaries

A couple of review papers:

Sohal et al., *J. Fuel Cell Science and Technology*, **9**(1), 11017 (2012) Hauch et al., *J. Mater. Chem.*, **18**, 2331 (2008) Knibbe et al., *Green*, 1(2), **141** (2011) Laguna-Bercero, *J. Power Soruces*, **203**, 4 (2012)

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view
- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance (H₂O / CO₂ / Co-electrolysis)
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells Where are we heading?

11. Summing up / leaning objectives



- I. Increased life time under realistic/technological relevant conditions
- II. Alternative electrode materials and cell design – all ceramic fuel electrodes, Sc-doped electrode, Sc-doped electrolyte, MIEC oxygen electrode (demands for barrier layer!)
- III. Cycling between SOFC and SOEC – interesting from at technological point of view
- IV. Pressurized test
- V. Stack testing





Electrolysis time (h)

Ref. Ebbesen, Høgh, Agersted, Nielsen & Mogensen, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy, 36, 7363 (2011)

Stack testing – a couple of examples

Also other groups working with SOEC stack testing e.g. Brisse/Schefold at CEA, and O'Brien/Stoots at INL (see graph below from "Status of the INL High-Temperature Electrolysis Research Program – Experimental and Modeling", 4th Information Exchange Meeting on the Nuclear Production of Hydrogen, 2009)

2,4 1.4 والا أستيا والعرا منتغليف لد أللال 2 1.2 ASR, Ohm cm² 91 ASR 0.8 increased furnace temperature from 800 C to 830 C 1.2 0.6 OCV check 0.4 0.8 0.2 200 400 600 800 1000 0 1200 0 200 400 600 800 1000 elapsed time, hrs elapsed time, hr

800 °C, steam electrolysis, -0.15 A/cm² (as far as I can read...)

Figure 9. (a) Area-specific resistance of a button cell as a function of time for 1100-hour test; (b) Area-specific resistance of a 25-cell stack as a function of time for a 1000-hour test.



Ref. Jensen, Sun, Ebbesen, Knibbe & Mogensen, Int. J. Hydrogen Energy, 35(18), 9544 (2010) + SOC references in this.

Outline

- 1. Intro who am I and who are you? + learning objectives
- 2. Repetition of basic working principle *small exercise*
- 3. SOE from a CO_2 cycle point of view
- 4. SOE from a economy / fuel production prices point of view
- 5. SOE cells Materials & initial performance (H₂O / CO₂ / Co-electrolysis)
- 6. SOE cells Materials & durability
- 7. Assignment Examples of impurity related degradation of SOE cells

Thursday Sept. 27th 2012

- 8. Feedback on assignment on impurity related degradation of SOE cells
- 9. SOE cells Other durability and degradation issues
- 10. SOE cells Where are we heading?

11. Summing up / leaning objectives



Learning objectives – 5 minutes – only pen and paper:

- 1. Explain/sketch qualitatively how electrolysis (potentially) can become an important player in a future energy grid?
- 2. Explain the basic operation principle for steam electrolysis, CO_2 electrolysis, co-electrolysis
- 3. List typical electrode materials incl. requirements and operation conditions
- 4. Give examples of SOEC degradation issues and explain why some of these can be somewhat different from what can be observed for similar SOFCs (based on material properties, test conditions etc.)



Maintain	Improve	Muddy point	New insight



EXTRA SLIDES

Durability



Single cell, steam electrolysis, Ni/YSZ-YSZ-CGO-LSCF/CGO cell.

Ref. Shefold, Brisse & Tietz, J. Electrochem. Soc., 159 (2), A137 (2012)

41 DTU Energy Conversion, Technical University of Denmark